

SCA ONTIER LLP
Halton House
20-23 Holborn
London EC1N 2JD
T: +44(0)20 7183 1701
F: +44(0)20 7183 1702
DX248 London/Chancery Lane
www.scaontier.com

By Post
Zeughausgasse 7a
XZug
6300
Switzerland

12 April 2019 Our Ref: WRI2.1

Attn: Vitalik Buterin and Ethereum Foundation

By Email

noreply@buterin.com

**Dear Sirs** 

## Postings on Github dated 9 April 2019 in a repository entitled 'cult-of-craig'.

We act for Dr Craig Wright, the computer scientist and businessman. Dr Wright was part of the team that created Bitcoin. He is the person behind the pseudonym Satoshi Nakamoto. He is resident in England and Wales, and so within the jurisdiction of the courts of England and Wales.

We strongly suggest that you take legal advice upon the contents of this letter, which is written in compliance with the Pre Action Protocol for Defamation applicable to claims in the High Court of England and Wales. The Protocol can be viewed at <a href="https://www.justice.gov.uk/courts/procedure-rules/civil/protocol/prot\_def">https://www.justice.gov.uk/courts/procedure-rules/civil/protocol/prot\_def</a>.

We write in respect of a publication made on the software development platform, Github, on 9 April 2019 entitled 'cult-of-craig' ('the Article'). The Article, currently accessible via the following url: https://github.com/vbuterin/cult-of-craig) contains the following words:

## "Craig's List

Facts about CSW's Involvement in Bitcoin

#### Social media shenanigans

· Sock puppets and fans

#### Forgeries/fakes

- Craig Wright faked blog posts
- Cright [sic] Wright faked PGP keys
- Craig Wright forged contracts and emails
- Craig faked threats
- Craigh [sic] Wright faked a public key signing

#### Fraud

- Craig Wright lied about owning MtGox' bitcoin
- Craig Wright falsely states he doesn't want fame or money

## Experts stating Craig Wright is a fraud

- Nik Cubrilovic (security expert): Craig Wright is not Satoshi Nakamoto
- Peter Rizun (Bitcoin Unlimited chief scientist): rejects Craig Wright's claim
- that Bitcoin can be faster than light speed
- Charlie Lee (Litecoin inventor): I can't believe some people still think he's Satoshi
- Vitalik Buterin (Ethereum inventor) writes 59 tweets about Craig Wright's talk: Craig Wright is crazy.
- Vitalik Buterin (Ethereum inventor) refutes Craig Wright's technobabble. See #12 for more
- Amaury Sechet (Bitcoin ABC lead developer) refutes Craig Wright's technobabble. See #12 for more
- Peter Rizun (Bitcoin Unlimited chief scientist) calls out Craig Wright lying about him
- Vitalik Buterin (Ethereum inventor) stands up at conference and calls Craig Wright a fraud
- Paul Sztorc (TruthCoin's chief scientist) shows how Craig Wright does not know basic math
- Andrew O'Hagan (London Review of Books editor) writes about how Craig Wright was paid \$15M to claim he was Satoshi to escape financial difficulties
- Craig Wright's mom says he's prone to lying
- Krawisz suggests that Craig Wright is over the top to specifically attract a nontechnical following. See also Microsoft research paper on Nigerian Prince scam emails
- In 2010, security expert says Craig Wright's writing is "complete drivel and even laughable"

### Craig Wright attacking profilic cryptocurrency experts

• Craig Wright attacks Cornell professor Emin Gün Sirer

#### **Appearances**

- Video: A Bitcoin Cash World Dr. Craig Wright and Jimmy Nguyen: At 23:25, CSW does not appear to know what signed/unsigned integers are
- Audio: GQ Releases Hilariously Sweary Audio of Craig Wright Interview
- Video: Craig Wright makes nonsensical claims (2014)
- Video: Craig Wright claims to be working on AI, and evolutionary code (obviously never happened)
- Craig Wright falsely claims secp256k1 can do pairing. See also Vitalik Explaining the topic

#### Other links

Deleted CSW LinkedIn page: 22 pages long"

The words complained of also include a significant number of hyperlinks leading to articles and videos about our client. A large number of these hyperlinks are highly defamatory of our client and, under English law, you are liable for republication of the contents of articles to which you hyperlink to.

Nonetheless, the posting alone - whether read in conjunction with the underlying hyperlinks or not - would have been understood by readers to mean that our client had fraudulently claimed to be Satoshi Nakamoto, the pseudonymous figure who was behind the creation of Bitcoin.

#### Serious harm

The above publication has caused serious harm to our client's reputation. The defamatory allegation you made is gravely serious, imputing dishonesty to our client.

Ethereum is a well-known decentralized platform and Mr Buterin, as the inventor of Ethereum is an individual with a significant public following. His Twitter account (accessible here: <a href="https://twitter.com/VitalikButerin">https://twitter.com/VitalikButerin</a>) currently has around 846,000 followers. Mr Buterin regularly speaks publicly about cryptocurrencies and similar technologies. He has linked via his account to his GitHub profile and his official website (accessible here: <a href="https://vitalik.ca/">https://vitalik.ca/</a>) also links to the profile on which the words complained of were published.

We therefore have no doubt that a substantial number of readers in this jurisdiction and internationally have read the Article and would take seriously the above allegation about our client.

## Responsibility for publication

The GitHub profile the defamatory material has been published on is undoubtedly Mr Buterin's. As referred to above, his official website links to the GitHub profile the Article was published on, and on 5 July 2018 (after the publication complained of had been published), Mr Buterin tweeted the following:

"Here is a VCR (Vitalik Curated Registry) of all of my active social media accounts:

http://github.com/vbuterin

http://reddit.com/u/vbuterin

https://twitter.com/VitalikButerin

There may be a few smaller ones but nothing mainstream. Everything else I either don't use or is a scam."

Mr Buterin, as the inventor of Ethereum, is also a director of the Ethereum Foundation and leads the Ethereum Foundation's research team. His profile appears (accessible here: https://ethereum.foundation/) on the Foundation's official website, and his biography includes a link to the GitHub page that the Article was published on. Mr Buterin's "about.me" page (accessible here: https://about.me/vitalik\_buterin) describes the Ethereum Foundation's official website as Mr Buterin's website.

The Ethereum Foundation's stated aim is to "promote and support Ethereum platform and base layer research, development and education." This mission is based upon publishing and supporting the code that underpins the Ethereum platform. A significant amount of this code is currently published on the GitHub page the Article was published on. By way of example, the GitHub page contains the code for the official Go implementation of the Ethereum protocol.

It is therefore clear that both Mr Buterin and the Ethereum Foundation, acting through Mr Buterin, were responsible for the GitHub page that the Article was published on, and are responsible as a matter of law for the publication of the Article complained of.

#### **Falsity**

Our client has not fraudulently claimed to be Satoshi Nakamoto. He is Satoshi Nakamoto. He played an integral part in the development of Bitcoin. He produced the report 'Bitcoin: A Peerto-Peer Electronic Cash System in October 2008', sent the first Bitcoin to Hal Finney in January 2009 and played an integral part in the development of Bitcoin. He has explained his role in detail on previous occasions.

## What our client requires

Our client requires the following from you:

- (1) Your assurance that you will preserve all documents, including electronic messages, draft articles, notes and any other electronic materials, that may be relevant to this matter.
- (2) Your undertaking to remove the above article and any other publication for which you are responsible, including on social media, that contains the allegation that our client had fraudulently claimed to be Satoshi Nakamoto. This includes removing any hyperlinks to articles which contain this allegation.
- (3) Your undertaking not to repeat those allegations, whether on the GitHub profile or elsewhere in any other form, including by hyperlinking to articles containing this allegation;
- (4) Your agreement to publish separate apologies to our client in the terms below;
- (5) Your agreement to join in a statement in open court in which you apologise to our client and acknowledge the falsity of the allegations.

Our client is plainly entitled to substantial damages in respect of the publication of the Article within this jurisdiction, as well as payment of the legal costs he has incurred in relation to this matter. However, his immediate priority is to ensure the quick and effective vindication of his reputation. He is therefore prepared to waive the entitlement to damages and costs if you agree, as a matter of urgency, to provide him with the remedies set out above. If however agreement cannot be reached, and our client does have to pursue proceedings against you, he will claim damages and legal costs.

We require your response to this letter by no later than 23 April 2019. Our client has already issued proceedings for libel against both Ethereum Foundation and Vitalik Buterin. In the absence of a satisfactory response our client will take further steps to serve these proceedings upon you without further notice.

Yours faithfully

**SCA ONTIER LLP** 

Enc: Pre-Action Protocol for Defamation

SCAONTIEVLLP

# Apology from Mr Buterin to be published on the public Twitter account, <a href="https://twitter.com/VitalikButerin">https://twitter.com/VitalikButerin</a>:

#### APOLOGY TO DR CRAIG WRIGHT

I was wrong to have alleged that Craig Wright fraudulently claimed to be Satoshi. I accept he is Satoshi. I am sorry Dr Wright. I will not repeat this libel.

## Apology from the Ethereum Foundation to be published on the Ethereum Foundation's website:

## Craig Wright: An Apology

On 12 February 2019 we published an article entitled 'Craig Wright gets caught lying about being Satoshi Nakamoto (Not the First Time)'

In that article we alleged that Craig Wright has fraudulently claimed to be Satoshi Nakamoto.

We accept that this claim is untrue, and that Mr Wright has not made any false or fraudulent claims. We accept that he is Satoshi Nakamoto, the pseudonymous figure who was behind the creation of Bitcoin.

We have removed the article, agreed not to republish this libellous allegation and will join in a statement to the High Court in London in which we apologise to Mr Wright for libelling him.